

24.00: Problems of Philosophy
Prof. Sally Haslanger
October 26, 2005

Second Argument Analysis Exercise

Write 2-3 pages providing an analysis of the following argument. In doing so,

- Number the premises and the conclusion. Articulate each premise and the conclusion in no more than one sentence. Feel free to use a different wording in your statement of the premises and conclusion than is provided by the text. You may not need to use every sentence in the passage in reconstructing the argument, and you may need to supply premises that are not explicitly stated in the text given.
- Indicate for each premise whether it is an assumption, or whether it is supposed to follow from earlier premises. (This should appear in parentheses after the premise.)
- After stating the argument, briefly explain it in your own words and comment on its cogency: Are its premises plausible? Are the inferences sound? (If not, why not?)

In the section entitled "The Knowledge Argument for Qualia", Frank Jackson gives two examples that he believes support a rejection of physicalism. One is the example of Fred, the other of Mary. Your job is to set out the premises in the "Fred Argument" leading Jackson to conclude, on the top of p. 269, "It follows that Physicalism leaves something out."

So...here is your starting and ending points:

1) It is possible for there to be a person, call him Fred, who sees two colors (red₁ and red₂) where we see one (red). (Assumption, p. 268)

...

C) Therefore, Physicalism leaves something out. (p. 269)

Fill in the argument.

DUE DATE: Friday, November 4, 3pm. Email your assignment to your teaching assistant as an attachment. TA's may also require hard copies. Late papers will be penalized.

NOTE: You may find the following websites helpful.

Philosophical Terms and Methods:

<http://www.princeton.edu/~jimpryor/general/vocab/index.html>

How to Read a Philosophy Paper:

<http://www.princeton.edu/~jimpryor/general/vocab/index.html>

Guidelines on Writing a Philosophy Paper

<http://www.princeton.edu/~jimpryor/general/writing.html>