Checklist for editing your partner's paper

First, read through the paper to get a sense of its main points and arguments. Do not line-edit at this point.

Begin your response by recording what you perceive to be the paper's thesis. Also state the essay's three strongest arguments, insights, or uses of evidence. Finally, state the three particular ways in which the paper could be revised so that it is more compelling (be they matters of argument, style, or clarity). You can do this on the back, or on a separate sheet.

Questions to consider:

Does the paper have a clear focus?

Do the particular arguments make sense?

Is their textual evidence cited to support these arguments?

Do the specific passages cited match the claims made?

Do the paragraphs help organize the paper by introducing new ideas or new aspects to previous arguments?

Are ideas and paragraphs sufficiently developed and clear?

Are the ideas presented in a logical order? Do paragraphs follow one another clearly? Are transitions adequate?

If you disagree at any point, why?

If you are unsure you follow or agree at any point, try to say why.

Go back through the paper and edit it carefully, making marginal comments and circling or underlining particular problems of expression. Use the abbreviations I include on the style sheet (linked to the syllabus online) if you wish.

Conclude your response by giving your overall appraisal of the essay, as well any other specific suggestions you think might help the author in revising it.