

# CREATE OR PERISH

*The Case for Inventions and Patents*

ROBERT H. RINES

*Rines and Rines*

*Boston, Massachusetts*

*Lecturer, Department of Electrical Engineering*

*Massachusetts Institute of Technology*

*Cambridge, Massachusetts*

PRELIMINARY EDITION

or Perish

NS) 68  
72  
75  
77  
79  
85  
90  
90  
93  
93  
93  
96  
98  
102  
107  
113  
117  
120  
120  
125  
131  
132  
132  
136  
136  
137  
137  
140  
140  
141  
142  
142  
143  
144  
145

# CREATE OR PERISH

*The Case for Inventions and Patents*

## CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
Footnotes	3
1. THE ORIGIN AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE AMERICAN PATENT SYSTEM	4
Conclusion	12
Footnotes	13
2. THE ROLE OF THE PATENT OFFICE AND THE COURTS	14
The Nature of the Patent Office	14
Patent Office Problems	17
Review of Patent Office Decisions	18
The Present Mood of the Courts	19
The Reports of Patent Office and Court Decisions	21
A Further Role of the Courts—Infringement Suits	23
Footnotes	26
3. THE PATENT LAW	27
Classes of Patentable Invention	27
Conditions of Patentability	31
Interference	36
The Statutory Test of Invention	37
Obviousness of "Subject Matter as a Whole"	39
Statutory Presumption of Validity of a Patent	42
Commentary—The Case for Sympathetic Legal Recognition of Inventions	43
Footnotes	46
4. PATENTS IN ACTION (THE HISTORY OF THE BASIC TELEPHONE PATENT)	48
The Circumstances Underlying Bell's Invention	48
Bell's Basic Patent	50
The Founding of Bell's Company—and the Pirates Enters the Supreme Court	53
How Would Our Present Supreme Court Probably React to Bell's Patent?	64
Footnotes	67

<b>5. THE RIGHTS, OBLIGATIONS, AND PROBLEMS OF OF INVENTORS (EMPLOYEE-EMPLOYER RELATIONS)</b>	<b>68</b>
University and Government Relations	72
Summary of Current Governmental Agency Regulations Concerning Patents	75
Industrial Employment Agreements	77
The Problems and Dangers in Negotiation—One of the Rare Proven Cases	79
Professor Cady Was Not Alone	85
Conclusion	90
Footnotes	90
<b>6. THE FUTURE OF AMERICAN PATENTS</b>	<b>93</b>
Previous Suggested Improvements in the Patent System	93
The Search	93
Opposition Proceedings	96
Technically Trained Tribunals	98
Are Today's Patents Worth Saving?	102
What Is Wrong?	107
The Task	113
Footnotes	117
<b>7. THE MODERNIZATION OF PATENT SYSTEMS</b>	<b>120</b>
Present Proposals for a Common European Patent and Judiciary	120
Some Different Ideas for Revision of the American Patent System	125
Footnotes	131
<b>8. COURT MODERNIZATION FOR AIDING THE PATENT SYSTEM AND THE LAW, IN GENERAL</b>	<b>132</b>
The Nature of the Criticism	132
A Few Measures Already Proposed	136
A Different Proposal	136
Conclusion	137
Footnotes	137
<b>9. A FORMULA FOR ECONOMIC DECLINE</b>	<b>140</b>
The Pity of Serendipity	140
"Mind-Forged Manacles"	141
"Conformity Is a Psychotic State"	142
"Mental Containers"	142
The Degree Slide Rule Won't Work This Time	143
A New Use for Senior Scientific Statesmen	144
Create or Perish	145

## INTRODUCTION

The American patent system needs no apologists. Though it may not be entirely suited in all respects to our current problems and needs, and though sometimes it may have been misused, its record of achievement in the progress of our country is indelibly written on the pages of history. Its current service; despite the fact that it is not being fully utilized in the second half of the century, seems to me equally indisputable; though some critics without firsthand experience in this field may not agree. Those critics are free to write their own books.

I have undertaken to write mine as a champion of the philosophy that today, as much as ever, incentives that make a person fight to be an individual promote the welfare of the whole state. In my lectures, many of which have been included in this book, I frankly paint a picture, particularly for engineers and applied scientists, that is based on this philosophy and thus supports patents [1].

But invention, patents, and innovation cannot be treated apart from their social, political, and economic environment, despite mechanistic courses given in law schools. Thus, to review the principles of patent law without delving into the interplay of many aspects of our society would be to discuss a theoretical, non-existent system. This book, therefore, is not addressed solely to engineers and applied scientists; some parts are addressed to lawyers, economists, businessmen, and politicians.

I have found the problem of presenting all facets so that they may be understood by readers of quite varied disciplines to be not without difficulty. For this reason illustrations have been confined to technology that can readily be comprehended by non-technicians, and legal and economic discussions have been kept sufficiently elementary to be grasped at least in part by the technical reader, but without sacrificing the point intended for the legalist or economist.

Those who expect an engineering "cookbook" approach to this subject will not find it here. Similarly, those who look for a presentation in the form of a Procrustean "case study" will be equally disappointed.

To write an interdisciplinary book requires a mixture of interdisciplinary techniques, and so I have tried to interweave

history, primary principles, procedures, problems, and points of conflict into what I believe to be the true fabric pattern of the patent system, struggling to stay alive in a world of rapid change. Because of this somewhat unorthodox approach, I have summarized the scope of each chapter at its head, and, in some cases, the reason for the approach used in order that the reader may better understand my mode of presentation.

In Chapter 1, a survey of the origin and historical background of the American patent system is presented; and, at its conclusion, serious questions are raised as to whether that system is currently either effectively performing its original historical purposes or meeting the requirements of the present. I hope that by the end of the book, the reader may have gained an insight into some of the answers to these questions.

Chapter 2 reviews the role of the Patent Office and the courts in the administration of the patent laws, especially for the benefit of those unfamiliar with the administrative details of patent application prosecution and judicial review.

The statutory provisions of American patent law are discussed in Chapter 3, with reference to actual cases interpreted and decided by the courts. While the classes of patentable inventions and the conditions of patentability can be readily agreed upon, there is widespread conflict as to the standard set by the 1952 Patent Act to determine what is "invention" and what is "obvious." I have, accordingly, devoted a section of this chapter to discussing this conflict, giving my own views—predicated upon what I feel is in the national interest, namely an interpretation that encourages the independent American inventor and his backers as well as corporate inventors. In this connection the chapter concludes with statistics offered by leading independent inventors pointing up their vital current contributions to technology and the necessity for liberal and sympathetic legal recognition of their work if the independent inventor is not to disappear from the American scene.

In Chapter 4, I have carried forward an illustrative approach found most effective in lecturing: tying together the complete picture of innovation—from the conception and invention stage, through financial backing and development, entrepreneuring, business formation, and legal contests with pirates. Here I have used the medium of the Bell Telephone Cases, because this outdated invention involves technology and a degree of importance familiar to all readers, and because almost everything that could happen did happen to Bell, except the anonymity experienced by many current inventors from which he was saved by a single vote in the Supreme Court.

Strongly woven through the fabric of the invention-innovation cycle are the relations between inventor and employer and between

inventor and p  
industrial, uni  
Since invention  
ventor are rev  
few proven cau  
viously little-l  
took over two  
The publicatio  
inventor, and  
ernmental age  
proprietary pc

Chapter 6  
the patent syst  
and the courts

I have left  
ization progra  
munity with th  
and law of pat  
system is note  
sible immedia  
system are pr

Though one  
book is the en  
problems  
than mer  
even prin  
said. In Chap  
technical sugg  
ovement wit  
have tried to  
follow, but wit  
professionals.

Chapter 9  
above problem

If in the en  
courts of our  
on more than  
deliberate, an  
is too late, le  
dignity, and r  
dynamic socie  
with governme  
the Free Worl

#### Footnotes

1. Gordon McL  
University,

or Perish

and points  
ern of the  
apid change.  
e summar-  
ne cases,  
der may

background  
its con-  
hat system  
historical  
I hope  
ed an

d the courts  
or the benefit  
patent appli-

re discussed  
ted and de-  
inventions  
ed upon,  
1952  
"ob-  
apter to  
cated upon  
erpretation  
nd his  
ection the  
independent  
is to tech-  
legal recog-  
t to disappear

ive approach  
complete  
tion stage,  
eneuring,  
. Here I have  
use this out-  
importance  
ing that could  
perienced by  
y a single vote

m-innovation  
yer and between

## Introduction

3

inventor and potential user or licensee. These include typical industrial, university, and governmental contract provisions. Since inventions are frequently stolen, the pitfalls facing the inventor are reviewed in Chapter 5. There are, however, very few proven cases of such piracy, and so I have selected a previously little-known example (in the field of piezoelectricity) that took over two decades to document and establish by legal decision. The publication of this exposure, it is hoped, may forewarn the inventor, and perhaps give second thoughts to business and governmental agencies in the matter of trying to circumvent the proprietary position of inventors.

Chapter 6 discusses critically recent proposals for improving the patent system, including current conflicting views in Congress and the courts as to government rights in patents and other matters.

I have left to Chapter 7 a consideration of the exciting modernization program being planned by the European Economic Community with the view of providing a single common European patent and law of patents. The possible effect of this upon the American system is noted, and some of my own views with regard to possible immediate improvements in the administration of our system are presented.

Though one of the expected primary groups of readers of this book is the engineering profession, the solution to current problems in the protection of inventions and patents calls for more than mere engineering consideration. There is a decided, and even primary, legal side concerning which something must be said. In Chapter 8, therefore, I have supplemented Chapter 7's technical suggestions for Patent Office and administrative improvement with proposals for modernizing judicial review. I have tried to formulate these in language that engineers can follow, but without losing their force for the legal and quasi-legal professionals.

Chapter 9 points up the general economic consequences of the above problems.

If in the end I am considered to have been too harsh on the courts of our land, my answer must be that my position is based on more than mere academic study. My attack is considered, deliberate, and to me necessary. My plea is simple. Before it is too late, let us restore to the individual his importance and dignity, and recognize and protect the fruits of his mind. A dynamic society led by free and encouraged creative minds—with government back in its role of servant and partner—offers the Free World's best hope.

### Footnotes

1. Gordon McKay Lectures on Patent Law, given at Harvard University, 1956-58.