

What is Policy Analysis?

Cherie Miot Abbanat , Lecturer

With

Margo Dawes, TA

Today's Class

- Survey
- What concerns you?
- Intro to the syllabus
- MIT Policies
- Problems in search of Policy
- Define Policy

Foundations

- Policy and Visions of Governance – Goal: Outline the Normative foundations of policy through a discussion of classical and modern liberalism
 - Locke, Smith, Mill, Rousseau, Kant, Rawles
- Theories of Public Policy and How we make choices: How does science relate to public policy, discuss policy models
- Values and Public Policy – political values, civic engagement, policy preferences, changing values, value differences in the numbers
- Policy Analysis: role of economics, growth of public policy, tools, limitations

Major Public Policies

- Defense Policy – structure, actors, cold war, nuclear arms race, post cold war, homeland security
- Education Policy – participants, reforms, policies, equity, policy models
- General Social Policy – actors, at-risk populations – elderly, children, handicapped, incapacitated.
- Public Health Policy – actors, policy functions of health and human services, Medicare, Medicaid, state children's health insurance program

Policy Process

- Agenda Setting – framing issues, theories, actors and roles
- Policy Formation – who formulates policy? theories
- Policy Implementation – types of implementation, issues surrounding implementation, actors
- Policy Evaluation/Termination – what is evaluation, what skills do we need? The types and methods used to evaluate.

Case Analysis

- Air Emissions
- Seed Conservation
- Boston Bussing
- Land Readjustment

Problems in search of Policy in the news

Flint Michigan:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xrdBbluExuQ>

The Americas:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2ibKEvsNq4I>

Heroine:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GmPeUYBLuBU>

TED Talk:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PY9DcIMGxMs>

Foundations

- Policy and Visions of Governance – Goal: Outline the Normative foundations of policy through a discussion of classical and modern liberalism
 - Locke, Smith, Mill, Rousseau, Kant, Rawles
- Theories of Public Policy and How we make choices: How does science relate to public policy, discuss policy models
- Values and Public Policy – political values, civic engagement, policy preferences, changing values, value differences in the numbers
- Policy Analysis: role of economics, growth of public policy, tools, limitations

Class 2 – The Role of Government

- Define Public Policy
- What is a Social Contract?
- What is Classical Liberalism?
- How much government do we want to purchase?
- Who are the Various Thinkers about the role of Government?
- What is Modern Liberalism?

Define Public Policy

- What the Government Ought to Do or Ought Not do?
- What the Government Does or does Not Do?
- What is government?
 - Group of institutions
 - Group of processes
 - Constantly Changing
 - Values Changing
 - Priorities adapting
 - Cultural diversity
 - Political evolution
 - New concerns

What is a Social Contract?

- Written agreement?
- Unwritten agreement?
- Between which parties?
- States what?
- Outlines what?
- What should be the scope?

What should be the scope of Government?

- How big should government be?
- How small?
- How much government do we want to pay for?
- How much benefits can we afford for all?
- What are the critical functions of a government?
- What is the minimum that we should provide?
- What is the maximum that we should provide?

What is Classical Liberalism?

- Reaction to being ruled by monarchs
- Product of the Enlightenment
- Revolutions
- Magna Carta
- A changed relationship of people to the government
- Question: who is the giver of rights?
- Question: who is rules and why and how?

Who was John Locke?

- Individuals have natural rights – god given rights
- Pre-government condition – state of nature
- Rights include: Life, Liberty and Personal Property
- You have the right to limit the use of others on your property
- Right to defend property against invasion
- Government is useful if it:
 - Protects your right to your property
 - Works for the people to enforce and police rights
 - Maximizes personal freedom

Assumptions -- Locke

- Negative Freedom -- Freedom from excessive government
- 1. We all possess natural rights
- We have natural rights in equal quantities
- Everyone has opportunity to participate in government and society
- Every individual has right to vote
- Equality of humanity exists
- Role of Government very limited
 - Social order
 - Individual freedom protection

Assumptions Cont.

- Public policy limits the positive use of personal freedom if:
 - Human spirit
 - Human ability
 - Impinges on individual rights
 - Diminishes civil society
- As Government increases scope of power, freedom and liberty of individual declines
- As government expands, great #s of decisions made through policy and not individual
- Reliance on individual responsibility and civil society in solving problems and meeting defined needs is replaced by public policy = passive powerless citizens

Who was Adam Smith?

- Individuals are rational self-maximizers, pursuing their individual good in private realm of marketplace and public sphere of government and civil society.
- Government Role = exclusively to protect individual and property rights and natural rights
- Shaped economic theory
- Believed in capitalism and limited social contract.

Adam Smith

(1723-1790)

- The invisible hand
- Belief in Equilibrium
- Markets provide what is needed

- “Every individual is continually exerting himself to find out the most advantageous employment for whatever capital he can command. It is his own advantage, indeed, and not the society which he has in view. But the study of his own advantage naturally or rather necessarily, leads him to prefer that employment which is most advantageous to the society...”

Smith, Adam. *An Inquiry Into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations, Volume 1*. Liberty Fund, 1982. © Liberty Fund. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

Adam Smith

- “When the regulation, therefore, is in support of the workmen, it is always just and equitable; but it is sometimes otherwise when in favor of of the masters”
- “No society can surely be flourishing and happy, of which the few greater part of the members are poor and miserable. It is but equity, besides, that they who feed, clothe, and lodge the whole body of the people, should have such a share of the produce of their own labor as to be themselves tolerable well fed, clothed and lodged”

Smith, Adam. *An Inquiry Into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations, Volume 1*. Liberty Fund, 1982. © Liberty Fund. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our CreativeCommons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

Adam Smith

On Taxes...

- “Subjects ought to contribute toward the support of the government, as nearly as possible in proportion to their respective abilities.”
- “It is not very unreasonable that the rich should contribute to the public experience, not only in proportion to their revenue, but something more than in proportion.”

Smith, Adam. *An Inquiry Into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations, Volume 1*. Liberty Fund, 1982. © Liberty Fund. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

Adam Smith

On education of the poor...

- “But though the common people cannot, in any civilized society, be so well instructed as people of some rank and future. The most essential parts of education, however, to read, write and account, can be acquired at so early a period of life, that the greater part even of those who are to be bred to the lowest occupations, have time to acquire them before they can be employed in these occupations. For a very small expense the public can facilitate, can encourage, and can even impose upon almost the whole body of the people the necessity of acquiring these most essential parts of education.”

Smith, Adam. *An Inquiry Into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations, Volume 1*. Liberty Fund, 1982. © Liberty Fund. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

Adam Smith

On schools (cont.)

- “The public can facilitate this acquisition by establishing in every parish or district a little school, where children may be taught for a reward so moderate, that even a common laborer may afford it, the master being partly, but not wholly paid by the public – because if wholly paid by public he would neglect it.”

Smith, Adam. *An Inquiry Into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations, Volume 1*. Liberty Fund, 1982. © Liberty Fund. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

Who was John Stuart Mill? (1806-1873)

- Extended liberalism to include a role for government in promoting social justice
- Freedom is limited and potential of individuals is limited
- Opportunities limited
- Does one recognize the human experience?
- Does one follow Locke? We are all equal?
- Equality is a real concern, we are not all born equal, we are not naturally equal.
-
- There is a role for government in recognizing inequalities and rectifying inequalities

John Stuart Mill

- “The question is not about restraining the actions of individuals, but about helping them: it is asked whether the government should do, or cause to be done, something for their benefit, instead of leaving it to be done by themselves individually, or in voluntary combination.”

On liberty...

“We should never interfere in actions that do not harm others, protecting individual freedom.”

Mill, John Stuart. *On Liberty*. Longman, Roberts, & Green Co., 1869. © Longman, Roberts, & Green Co. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

John Stuart Mill

On the welfare of children...

- “It still remains unrecognized, that to bring a child into existence without a fair prospect of being able, not only to provide food for its body, but instruction and training for its mind, is a moral crime, both against the unfortunate offspring and against society; and that if the parent does not fulfill this obligation, the State ought to see it fulfilled; at the charge, as far as possible, of the parent.”

Mill, John Stuart. *On Liberty*. Longman, Roberts, & Green Co., 1869. © Longman, Roberts, & Green Co. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

John Stuart Mill

On education...

“If the government would make up its mind to require for every child a good education, it might save itself the trouble of providing one. It might leave to parents to obtain the education where and how they pleased, and content itself with helping to pay the school fees of the poorer classes of children, and defraying the entire school expenses of those who have no one else to pay for them.”

Mill, John Stuart. *On Liberty*. Longman, Roberts, & Green Co., 1869. © Longman, Roberts, & Green Co. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

What is Modern Liberalism?

- What is “good” government?
- What is “good” public policy?
- Contributions by philosophers pushing the role of the government
- Rousseau, Kant, Rawls

Who was Rousseau?

- Asserting the rights of all citizens
- Exploring the social contract – the role of government to serve the will of the people.
- The idea of the "general will" -- that it is always right
- Defense of direct democracy
- That the people should control the government and the government should work for the people – government by the people and for the people
- Encourage active involvement of citizens in government
- Political leaders should act as agents of the citizens and not elected, independent decision makers
- Role in French Revolution

Rousseau

On government..

“What then is the government? An intermediate body established between the subjects and the sovereign for their mutual communication and charged with the execution of the laws of the preservation of liberty, both civil and political.”

Rousseau, Jean Jacques. *Social Contract & Discourses*. E. P. Dutton & Co., 1913. © E. P. Dutton & Co. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

Criticisms of Rousseau

- Assumes that the “general will” is always correct
- Assumes that personal preferences are a function of being in a society and not of self-interest.
- Does the general will emerge from society or from a few enlightened individuals within a society?

Who was Kant?

(1724-1804)

- Rousseau questions or dismisses the ideas of Natural Rights – that rights are bestowed by a creator
- What are objects and how can we know them?
- How do we come to know something?
- Rationalism grounds all knowledge in reason
- Empiricism traces all knowledge to experience
- Blending Rationalism and Empiricism
- What is our principal source of knowledge?

Kantian Ideas

- In essence, we see things differently, we may see inequality differently.
- There is no notion of the pre-existence of equality – not God given equality.
- There are variations in the conditions and state of individuals.
- We do not enter the social contract as equals.
- Rights emerge from the state or society, not from a creator.
- Use uniform science for observation, for inquire and analysis

Who Was John Rawls?

- Individuals are capable of reason
- Individuals desire the maximum freedom possible in order to achieve their maximum benefit, producing inequalities.
- Justice as fairness – a reasonable social position where individuals pursue their private interests while preserving the rights of other members of society to preserve their freedom to max. benefits too.
- *Equal representation* of individuals via the voting process
- *Difference principal*: Wealth and income do not have to be equal for all members of society, but end result must benefit all purchasers of social contract

Rawls on Justice

On justice..

“It is these inequalities, presumably inevitable in the basic structure of any society, to which the principles of social justice must in the first instance apply. These principles, then, regulate the choice of a political constitution and the main elements of the economic and social system. The justice of a social scheme depends essentially on how fundamental rights and duties are assigned and on the economic opportunities and social conditions in the various sectors of society.”

Rawls, John. *A Theory of Justice*. Harvard university Press, 2009. © Harvard University Press. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

Rawls on Equality

- Obviously the purpose of these conditions is to represent equality between human beings as moral persons, as creatures having a conception of their good and capable of a sense of justice

Rawls on Just Institutions

- “The desire to follow rules and impartially and consistently, to treat similar cases similarly, and to accept the consequences of the application of public norms is intimately connected with the desire, or at least the willingness, to recognize the rights and liberties of others and to share fairly in the benefits and burdens of social cooperation.”

Rawls, John. *A Theory of Justice*. Harvard university Press, 2009. © Harvard University Press. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see <https://ocw.mit.edu/help/faq-fair-use/>.

Rawls on Justice

- “I shall maintain instead that the persons in the initial situation would choose two rather different principles;

The first requires equality in the assignment of basic rights and duties,

While the second holds that social and economic inequalities, for example inequalities of wealth and authority, are just only if they result in compensating benefits for everyone, and in particular for the least advantaged members of society.”

What is Policy?

- Public policy is what government ought or ought not to do
- The judgments we make about what gov't ought or ought not to do are related to generally accepted principles of government and society.
- The US gov't was established on principles of classical liberalism – limited role for government, the protection of citizens and natural rights.
- Modern liberal thought rejects the idea of natural rights, and argues that rights are based on reasonableness, rationality, and evolve over time

What is Policy

- Modern Liberalism concludes that government should protect citizens from inequalities that are created by society
- Classical Liberalism and Modern Liberalism are useful in helping us to understand and illustrating some of the ways we think about government and what it ought and ought not do.

Theories of Policy Analysis

- A good model helps describe policy making
- A good model helps explain public policy or policy making
- A good model may predict

Normative - big ideas that shape collective decisions about what gov't ought/ ought not do

Empirical - what gov't does/ does not do

Policy science - determine what gov't can do

Key Policy Models

- Rational comprehensive
- Incrementalism
- Public choice
- Group theory
- Systems theory
- Institutionalism
- Elite theory
- Game theory
- Neo-institutionalism

MIT OpenCourseWare
<https://ocw.mit.edu>

11.003J / 17.303J Methods of Policy Analysis
Spring 2016

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: <https://ocw.mit.edu/terms>.