



REVISITING THE FIELD

Planning from “above” and “below”

11.201 GATEWAY: Planning Action

Rajagopal and Briggs

18 October 2005



Bankers are people too

**“World Bank wants to
bring happiness to
ordinary people”**

Times of India (May 7, 2002)



Today's agenda

- **Taking stock: Modern planning's origins vs. planning-from-below**
- **Contexts for planning: Planning in the Third World, assumptions and realities**
 - Participation and democracy
 - Law and institutions etc.
- **Development as change**
 - History of paradigms
 - Development as freedom (Sen)
- **Dams/big projects: state of play**
- **Radical planning, power**



Rational planning ... from *above*

Assumptions of the **rational** model:

- Stakeholders are already organized (in political communities)
- Guiding values are clear
- Citizens are *trusting* and the state is *trustworthy* – liberal “harmony” vision
- Technically competent bureaucracies have the needed expertise (no citizen learning or participation required)
- Alternatives have been considered



Planning from above vs. below

- **Rights, accountability, and power**
- **The promise of citizen involvement vs. the risk of cronyism, parochialism, process paralysis (impasse)**
- **Civil society and government interaction: Competing, collaborating, contesting, other?**
- **Globalization: Transnational coalitions, media influence, information technology shifts in power and voice**



Trained vs. indigenous experts

- What forms of knowledge are *valid*? Who sets the rules?
- What does public participation add to what technical experts provide?
- How can distinct types of expertise be *blended* to create better, not just more popular, solutions?
- Technocratic modernism vs. “deliberative democracy”



Context: Planning in the 3rd World

- **Differences with the West:**
 - Democratic
 - Legal
 - Inward-looking
- **Breaking boundaries**
 - Domestic v. International
 - Institutional v. Non-Institutional
- **Within 'Development' discourse**
- **Globalized**



Law and legal institutions (A)

- **Is law simply institutional politics?**
- **Law as a terrain of resistance**
- **Law and scale: law simultaneously defines scale and destabilizes scale**
- **Global space of law**
 - Proliferation of global norms and institutions
 - Human rights and environment



Law and legal institutions (B)

- **Law as a framework for social mobilization**
- **Contestation through the law as a conscious strategy in mobilization and the tradeoffs**
- **Resort to law as an escape from politics?**
- **Domestic legal culture and nature of legal system as major variables in social mobilization**



Development as change (A)

- **History of paradigms**
- **Current state of the field**
- **Development and the role of democracy**
- **Sen's theory: Development as freedom**
- **Critique of income poverty**
- **Commodities, capabilities and functionings**



Development as change (B)

- ***Constitutive and instrumental* roles of freedoms in development**
- **Role of policy in *translating* capabilities into freedoms**
- **Universal nature of the theory and its tensions with its own ethical aspirations**



Dams/big projects: State of play

- **The World Bank**
 - Revival of Bank interest
 - Bank's role in big projects
 - Bank's Inspectional Panel
- **Accountability (e.g. Export-Import Banks)**
- **Continuing crisis, examples**
 - Ilisu (Turkey)
 - Lesotho Highlands Water Project



Friedmann's *radical planning*

- **Critical (normative + analytic) of the status quo**
- **Pragmatic as to means, strategic**
- **Inclusive, pro-participation: But there are many dilemmas here**
- **Reflective, iterative (social learning)**
- **Guided by meaning, ideology**
- **Oppositional: Mainly? As needed?**



Six levels of power

- 1. Frames and meanings:** How the issues are thought about (“symbolic power”)
- 2. Agendas:** What’s on it, what’s not?
- 3. Options:** Expanding vs. limiting
- 4. Judgment:** Influence over criteria
- 5. Decision-making:** Influence over choices
- 6. Production:** Getting things implemented (capacity to produce)

Source: Briggs (2003) *Organizing stakeholders*



Preview: Anacostia Waterfront

KEY ISSUES:

- **The city as “growth machine” vs. “equitable development”**
- **Comprehensiveness vs. incrementalism**
- **The power and limits of physical revitalization and “placemaking”**