Preparation for the critical review

Moving beyond observation: finding your way to a viable thesis and strategy.

- 1. **Observation**: Here is where most of you began.
 - o What are the distinctive features of the videos that you have chosen?
 - o How are the two documentaries different?
 - o Which of the two did you prefer?
- 2. Analysis: Moving beyond thoughtful observations toward an enlightening thesis.
 - o How can you account for the distinctive features and differences that you observed? (lots of possibilities here)
 - What assumptions have the producers made about the audience?
 - 1. Do these assumptions affect the distinctive features & differences?
 - Is there an unintended cost to the transformation or filtering of scientific knowledge in this field? (You might ask similar questions about other types of knowledge presented in the film.)
 - Does one of the articles on science documentaries help you make sense of the decisions made by the directors of your documentaries?
 - Why do your specific conclusions matter? How do you move beyond two specific films toward some broader insight?
- 3. **Persuasion & enlightenment:** How do you translate your own insights into an engaging and enlightening critical review?
 - Where should you start?
 - o What kinds of background information do your readers need?
 - About the general topic?
 - About the individual films?
 - Why should your readers care about the issues addressed in your critical review?
 - How should you explain the logic behind your thesis?
 - What kind of evidence do you need? How can you show—rather than tell—your readers how specific evidence from the films clarifies & supports your thesis?
 - o Is there some scene or sequence of scenes in each documentary that offers a particular clear view of the way that the producers have transformed or filtered the scientific findings?
 - How might the critical article that you read help you articulate and support your thesis?
 - Where has this process taken you? What broader insight should your readers take away from this critical review?

Reminder: You cannot assume that your readers want to read about your documentaries just because you chose this particular pair. Make sure that you have something to say to your readers.

MIT O	penCourseWare
https://	ocw.mit.edu

21W.034 Science Writing and New Media: Perspectives on Medicine and Public Health Fall 2016

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: https://ocw.mit.edu/terms.