

## JUSTICE

### Lecture 4 – Revisionist Utilitarianism

1. Last time
  - a. How to weigh majority's antipathy towards unpopular private conduct?
  - b. Supreme Court: majority's antipathy doesn't count where fundamental rights at stake
  - c. Bentham: no fundamental rights + majority's antipathy always counts for *something*
  - d. Does utilitarianism support civil liberties? For the right reason?
2. Mill's revisionist utilitarianism
  - a. Measure of a just law/action is (still) its consequences, how much *good* it produces
  - b. Pleasure is (still) the only thing that is good in itself, *but*
  - c. Some pleasures are of higher quality, can't be outweighed by lower pleasures
  - d. Civil liberties are required to maximize the higher pleasures
3. Mill's distinction between higher and lower pleasures
  - a. A life is better—happier—when it contains higher pleasures, even if less satisfaction
  - b. Higher pleasures are the ones preferred by (all or almost all) competent judges
  - c. Competent judges "decidedly prefer" pleasures that come from exercise of intellect
4. Why are intellectual pleasures better/higher *for everyone*?
  - a. Some people prefer other pleasures. Why should they defer to "competent judges"?
  - b. Is Mill's argument elitist?
5. Why are *intellectual* pleasures better/higher?
  - a. Use of our intellectual faculties awakens a sense of our own dignity
  - b. Sense of our own dignity produces a desire to develop & exercise our higher faculties
  - c. Once we have this desire, we can't be happy without engaging our higher faculties

6. Is the development/exercise of our faculties valuable *only* because it brings us pleasure?

- a. Is it *intrinsically* valuable to develop and exercise your faculties?
- b. To be a certain kind of person? Actually to experience certain things?

7. Mill's distinct view of the special importance of liberties:

- a. Bentham:
  - i. All pleasures/pains equal; none contributes more to happiness than any other
  - ii. Civil liberties founded on general value of avoiding pain (*e.g.* from punishment)
  - iii. Civil liberties not founded on anything of *special* value
- b. Mill:
  - i. Pleasures derived from developing & using our distinctive faculties are better
  - ii. Civil liberties are necessary for developing & exercising our distinctive faculties
  - iii. Civil liberties founded on *special, higher* value of developing & using our faculties

MIT OpenCourseWare  
<http://ocw.mit.edu>

24.04J / 17.01J Justice

Spring 2012

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: <http://ocw.mit.edu/terms>.