PROJECT EVALUATION (1.011)

Spring 2011
Lecture 10

Instructors: Professor Joseph Sussman
             Carl Martland
Teaching Assistants:
             Nihit Jain
             Edna Edzell

Civil and Environmental Engineering
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
What is HSR

• Definitions vary
  — ~ 180- 200 mph is the international standard for maximum speed
  — Usually fewer stops as compare to conventional rail
  — Often (but not always) city center to city center--the competitive edge with air
  — Steel wheels on steel rails
    But some talk of HSGT (“high speed ground transportation”) to include MAGLEV
Why HSR I

- Motivation
  - Economic growth
    - Enhanced productivity
    - The “mega-region” idea-- labor markets, commercial markets
  - Social integration
  - Environmental/energy benefits
  - Jobs: economic stimulus
Why HSR II

• Congested Corridors
  • The idea-- you simply need the capacity and air and highway are congested already
  • Example: The Northeast Corridor in the U.S. connecting Boston-- New York--Washington
    • I-95
    • Logan in Boston, JFK, LaGuardia, Newark in New York, and Reagan National, Dulles in Washington
Why not HSR?

- Those against say
  - VERY EXPENSIVE both to build and to operate
  - Ridership VERY uncertain
  - Benefits are overstated and costs understated
  - Economic growth is really just a redistribution of economic activity-- no net growth
  - Not clear that environment/energy benefits will actually happen
Where HSR competes well

- The sweet spot
  - ~ 150 miles to ~ 600 miles
  - At shorter distances, auto is competitive
  - At longer distances, air is competitive
Deciding about HSR

- Run the process
- Costs
- Benefits
- Stakeholders
- Financing
- Consider alternatives
A Framework for Project Evaluation

From Martland

Project ID

Analysis of Alternatives

Accessing and Comparing Alternatives

Implementation

Ongoing Evaluation

Civil and Environmental Engineering
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Infrastructure Issues

• Where to get the $?
• What are the political concerns?
  – Whose district or state benefits
  – Environmental justice
• What are the costs and benefits?
  – Who bears the costs?
  – Who reaps the benefits?
• Is the project the “best use” of the $?
• What are the environmental impacts?
• What are the social impacts?

Civil and Environmental Engineering
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
HSR Issues/Questions I

• New ROW vs. upgrading what we have?
  • The idea of “incremental HSR” -- upgrade current lines to provide ~125mph service
• Limit to just passengers vs. have a hybrid system with both passenger and freight
HSR Issues/Questions II

• Develop your own technology vs. Buy it abroad
  • Japan
  • France
  • Germany
  • Italy
  • Korea
  • Taiwan
  • China
  • United States
HSR Issues/Questions III

- Accessing the HSR station
- City Center or locate elsewhere-- pros and cons
- The “last 20 miles”
HSR around the Globe

- Why has HSR been developed at so many places around the Globe but not in the U.S.?
Reference: *HSR in America*, by America2050

- America2050 is an advocacy group
- That is in contrast with scholarly literature
  - Givoni
  - Albalete and Bel
Findings from *HSR in America*, by America2050 I

- Where HSR can work
  - Corridors of 100-600 miles
  - Major employment and population centers
  - In the US, 11 megaregions, with 70% of US population and regional GDP is located

Civil and Environmental Engineering
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Findings from *HSR in America*, by America2050 II

- Where HSR can work
  - Promising short corridors, possible as part of a longer corridor
    - New York- Philadelphia
    - Los Angeles- San Diego
    - Chicago- Milwaukee
Findings from *HSR in America*, by America2050 III

• Where HSR can work
  • Very large city (or cities) are “powerful” generators of rail traffic on a corridor with medium and smaller cities-- the anchor tenant idea
  • Likely to generate more traffic than corridors of the same overall population with just medium cities

Civil and Environmental Engineering
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Findings from *HSR in America*, by America2050 IV

- Where HSR can work
  - Workforce composition is important
    - “Knowledge workers” more likely to travel
    - Industrial areas generate less passenger traffic than “knowledge industries” such as finance

Civil and Environmental Engineering
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
HSR in the U.S.

- Federal funds
- Spread out over a number of states
- The hope: the states and the private sector will partner
  - California
  - Wisconsin
  - Ohio
HSR in the U.S. II

- The reality: a lot of uncertainty
  - Costs--these are BIG projects
  - Benefits-- depends on uncertain ridership
  - Can the financing be cobbled together?
HSR in the U.S. III

• A key question: Is this a set of projects or a program?
• Compare and contrast with the Interstate System
Source: United States Federal Government.
VISION for HIGH-SPEED RAIL in AMERICA

Source: United States Federal Government.
Applications in Spain m(3/5)
High speed rail - AVE

High Speed Railroad Map of Japan removed due to copyright restrictions. This image can be viewed on Wikipedia: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/File:Shinkansen_map_20110312_en.png.
1.011 Project Evaluation
Spring 2011

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: http://ocw.mit.edu/terms.