Engineering, Economics & Regulation of the Electric Power Sector

ESD.934, 6.974

Session 12 Module D.3

Generation & wholesale markets Wholesale market design

Prof. Ignacio J. Pérez-Arriaga















Choices in wholesale market design Structure & governance

List of topics:

- Unbundling of activities
- Horizontal concentration
- Vertical integration
- Risk allocation
- Governance of market institutions
- Role of competition authorities
- A market within a wider market
 - → The players & their environment

9

Issues on structure & governance Vertical integration

Complete unbundling of generation/retailing from network activities

□ Avoid consolidation of vertical integration (generation & retail to *captive* consumers) via opaque physical bilateral contracts →

- separation of activities
- public auctions to allocate the contracts
- mandatory purchase from the pool
- Diagonal integration (gas & electricity)









Backstop to self-governance by market institutions; possibility of improving rules

- Make sure that market information is facilitated to all interested parties on a non discriminatory basis
- Expert market surveillance
 - Market power abuse
 - investigation of specific complaints





Choices in wholesale market design **Organization**

List of topics:

Elements of the wholesale market

- Products & services
- Mandatory pools, bilateral contracts & power exchanges
- Short-term (spot) markets
- Balancing market & provision of ancillary services
- Major issues in organization
 - Role of demand / firmness of transactions / long-term security of supply / hedging contracts / market power

→ The allowed transactions



















The short-term (spot, typically day-ahead) market

In most market models there is a short-term (typically day-ahead) market that provides the reference price for the remaining transactions

≻Key issue is the potential for arbitraging between markets
Why such a diversity of auction formats?

- >Bids: simple, complex, continuous, iterative
- > Dispatch: self-committed, centralized, zoom
- >Network: single node, zonal, nodal

➔ Trade-off in market design: simplicity & transparency versus efficiency & avoidance of risk











Issues in market organization Long-term security of supply

The questions

- Can system short-term marginal prices remunerate the total costs of all plants?
- Can consumers choose their level of reliability of supply?
- The proposed solutions
 - Leave it to the market
 - Regulated capacity payments
 - Capacity markets
 - Price risk-hedging contracts

Issues in market organization Information disclosure

Market information must be accessible to all interested parties without discrimination

- Trade-off between
 - availability of complete market information
 - example: disclosure on the following day of all accepted & non accepted bids
 - potential for collusion

Issues in market organization Codes of good practice

Implicit (most frequent) or explicit (e.g. the Single Electricity Market in Ireland) is a central piece in the regulatory compact

- Competition by itself is not a deterrent against anticompetitive behavior is actual markets
- A basic understanding of what is permissible (legal) or not is necessary

Hierarchy of decisions in wholesale

market design

Structural & governance issues *Who are the players?*

Organization issues What are the possible transactions?

Implementation issues *What are the rules of the game?*

36







© ISO / RTO Council. All rights reserved. This content is excluded from our Creative Commons license. For more information, see http://ocw.mit.edu/fairuse.

Typical functions of a Power Exchange

Reception of bids

Elaboration of the merit order

Computation of the market price

- Centralization and processing of measurement data
- Economic settlement
- □ Market supervision (*support to regulator*)
- Proposal of modification of market rules

Characterization of Power Exchanges

Market participation

Trading timing

Traded products / trading periods

□Bid and offer format

Trading methods / pricing criteria

Market participation

Participation can be:

- Compulsory in a gross market ("Pool")
- Voluntary in a net market for surpluses & deficits
- □ All PXs in the EU are voluntary
 - Participation may be compulsory for some types of trading (e.g. inter-zonal trading in Nordic countries should be effected through Nord Pool)
 - Some entities may be required to use PXs for part of the energy they trade (e.g. the Single Buyer in Italy or a prescribed % in OMEL for long-term contracts)
 - Participation is mandatory in ISOs & RTOs in the US
- □ Diversity of roles for demand (load/LSE)



Germany: continuous trading

















- Bids and offers for a specified delivery period are submitted at any time during the trading session
- As soon as it is submitted, each bid/offer is matched, if possible, with offers/bids already submitted for the same delivery period and specifying compatible quantities and prices
- The execution price of a transaction is generally the price specified in the bid/offer submitted earlier
- If no match can be found, bids/offers are held and shown in the "trading book" to be matched with offers/ bids submitted later in the same trading session









- Some ISOs have set long-term resource adequacy requirements for generation
 - New England & PJM have an auction-based forward capacity market (4 years in advance)
 - New York has a demand-curve based monthly capacity market



Formats of contracts

Properties	Trading Method	
	Over-the-Counter	Power Exchange
Anonymity of Trading	No	Yes
Counterparty	Bilateral	Central counterparty
Counterparty Risk	Yes, unless cleared	No
Trading Method	Continuous Trading	Either Continuous or Central Auction

Formats of contracts

Contracts may be:

- Customised (bilateral)
 - Respond to the requirements of counterparties
- Standardised (anonymous)
 - Standard features and clauses
 - >Easier to negotiate
 - Easier to trade in a secondary market

Brokers may facilitate the conclusion of bilateral contracts by matching counterparties with compatible requirements

Delivery can be physical or financial

Physical

Financial

Entail physical and cash delivery on expiry

The "hub" (delivery point) is the High Voltage Grid or some node in it

Participants need a right to transport the scheduled volume of power

TSOs must approve the schedules of all participants, to prevent constraints

A mechanism is put in place by the TSOs for settlement and management of the real time imbalances Entail only cash delivery on expiry

Differences between an specified index and the contractual price are settled

The buyer pays the contractual price and the seller pays the index

Physical purchased/sold through Spot or physical contract

Exchange (or Pool) prices are normally selected as index

Market liquidity is important to provide a reliable index



<the table shows directly the amount received by each agent.>

63

Contracts for differences (CfD's) Deviations & incentives

 \Box Viewpoint #1: Price P_c for contracted amount q_c is guaranteed, but deviations are priced at market price P_m ➡ Effect of deviations (a generator):

- contracted amount q_c
- produced amount q_n
- Revenue: $q_c \times P_c + P_m \times (q_p q_c)$
- $\diamond q_p q_c$ subject to pool price risk

□ If the CfD is signed by a physical generator who makes its production q_p equal to the contracted amount qc, then it is totally hedged (but a pure speculator with no production is fully exposed to the CfD contract risk)



□ Viewpoint #2: The implications of the CfD contract $q_c \times (P_c - P_m)$ and the participation in the market *(if this is the case)* with production q_p at a price P_m are examined separately

- ➡ Final economic settlement (a generator):
- contracted amount q_c
- produced amount q_p
- Revenue: $q_c \times (P_c P_m) + q_p \times P_m$
- •qp is totally exposed to pool price risk

The existence of the CfD contract should not modify the behaviour of the generator in the spot market











Organized forward & futures markets Financial (derivatives) trading (1)

- Prices in wholesale electricity markets vary from trading period to trading period, as a result of demand
 – supply interaction and transmission capacity
- Participants are exposed to the risk resulting from the variability of revenues/costs from selling/buying electricity
- As in financial markets, electricity derivative instruments provide risk hedging

71

Organized forward & futures markets Financial (derivatives) trading (2)

- Non tradable contracts
 - CfDs are difficult to trade
 - >Adapted to parties' requirements, non standard
 - >Non centrally settled, each party bears default risks

Tradable contracts

- >Standard terms, non adapted to parties' requirements
- >Centrally settled, when traded through organized market
- Favour trading liquidity




















Example Operating reserves in Spain

Secondary reserves

- Required bands (MW up & down) are specified for each hour by the System Operator after the daily market closes
- Generators may bid prices (\$/kW) & bands (kW) to go up & down
- Selected **bands** are paid the resulting marginal price (\$/kW)
 & the cost is charged to consumers as an uplift
- All energy used in secondary regulation is paid the price (\$/ kWh) of energy of tertiary reserves & the cost is charged to the agents (generators or consumers) who use secondary reserves (deviations between scheduled and real energy, both generators and consumers)

Example Operating reserves in Spain

Tertiary reserves

- After the daily market closes, any capable agent may bid blocks of energy & prices (\$/kWh) to go up & down
- The System Operator establishes an economic priority list and uses the bids if needed
- All used bids (& only them) in a given hour are paid the price of the last used bid in that hour (\$/kWh)
- The cost is charged to the agents (generators or consumers) who use tertiary reserves (deviations between scheduled and real energy, both generators and consumers)

84









When generation must be constrained-on because of a network constraint, there is typically very little room for competition (typically just one company can solve the problem)

- Preferred: Regulated remuneration or contracts (difficult to cover all possibilities)
- Also: Pay-as-bid, under regulator's surveillance & subject to competition law

88





















ESD.934 / 6.695 / 15.032J / ESD.162 / 6.974 Engineering, Economics and Regulation of the Electric Power Sector Spring 2010

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: http://ocw.mit.edu/terms.